

# Review Criteria at a Glance

---

## CONTENTS

|  |   |
|--|---|
| Review Criteria at a Glance – Research.....  | 2 |
| Review Criteria at a Glance – Training ..... | 3 |
| Review Criteria at a Glance – Other.....     | 4 |

# REVIEW CRITERIA AT A GLANCE – RESEARCH

|   | Research/Research Center<br>(R, DP, RC, P, U01 etc.)  | Institutional R25  | Conferences and Scientific Meetings<br>R13/U13  | SBIR/STTR<br>(R41, R42, R43, R44)  | Academic Research Enhancement Award<br>(AREA)<br>(R15)   |
|---|---|--|---|--|--|
| <b>Overall Impact</b>   | <u>Overall Impact</u>   | <u>Overall Impact</u>  | <u>Overall Impact</u>   | <u>Overall Impact</u>  | <u>Overall Impact</u>  |
| <b>Scored Review Criteria</b><br><br>(Scored individually and considered in overall impact score)<br><br>PAR & RFA: May add questions to each scored criterion or additional criteria       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Significance</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Investigator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Innovation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Approach</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment</u></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Significance</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Investigator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Innovation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Approach</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment</u></li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Significance</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Investigator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Innovation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Approach</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment</u></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Significance</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Investigator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Innovation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Approach</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment</u></li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Significance</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Investigator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Innovation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Approach</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment</u></li> </ul>  |
| <b>Additional Review Criteria</b><br><br>(Not scored individually, but considered in overall impact score)<br><br>PAR & RFA: May add new criteria or questions to each additional criterion | <p>U01-BRP only:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Partnership and Leadership</u></li> </ul> <p>All:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Appropriate Representation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Phase II</u></li> <li>• <u>Fast Track</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> |
| <b>Additional Review Considerations</b><br><br>(Not scored individually and not considered in overall score)  | <p>U01-BRP only:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Technology Transfer</u></li> </ul> <p>All:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Applications from Foreign Organizations</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>• <u>Authentication of Key Biological and/or Chemical Resources</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Recruitment &amp; Retention Plan to Enhance Diversity</u></li> <li>• <u>Training in the Responsible Conduct of Research</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget and Period of Support</u></li> </ul>       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Provision of Family Care Facilities</u></li> <li>• <u>Applications from Foreign Organizations</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget and Period of Support</u></li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>• <u>Authentication of Key Biological and/or Chemical Resources</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>• <u>Authentication of Key Biological and/or Chemical Resources</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>  |
| <b>Additional Comments to Applicant</b>   | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>   | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>   | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  |

## REVIEW CRITERIA AT A GLANCE – TRAINING

|  | Fellowship<br>(F30, F31, F32, F33)  | Career Development<br>(K01, K02, K07, K08, K23, K24, K25, K99)   | Institutional Training<br>(T32, T35, K12)  |
|--|---|--|--|
| <b>Overall Impact</b>  | <u>Overall Impact/Merit</u>   | <u>Overall Impact</u>  | <u>Overall Impact</u>  |
| <b>Scored Review Criteria</b><br><br>(Scored individually and considered in overall impact score)            | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Fellowship Applicant</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Sponsors, Collaborators, and Consultants</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Research Training Plan</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Training Potential</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Institutional Environment &amp; Commitment to Training</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Candidate</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Career Development Plan/Career Goals &amp; Objectives/Plan to Provide Mentoring</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Research Plan</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Mentor(s), Co-Mentor(s), Consultant(s), Collaborator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment &amp; Institutional Commitment to the Candidate</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Training Program and Environment</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Training PD/PI</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Preceptors /Mentors</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Trainees</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Training Record</u></li> </ul> <p>Other T programs use other criteria</p>                                       |
| <b>Additional Review Criteria</b><br><br>(Not scored individually, but considered in overall impact score)   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> </ul>             | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> |
| <b>Additional Review Considerations</b><br><br>(Not scored individually and not considered in overall score) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Training in the Responsible Conduct of Research</u></li> <li>• <u>Applications from Foreign Organizations</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Training in the Responsible Conduct of Research</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>• <u>Authentication of Key Biological and/or Chemical Resources</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Recruitment &amp; Retention Plan to Enhance Diversity</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Training in the Responsible Conduct of Research</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>  |
| <b>Additional Comments to Applicant</b>  | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>   | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  |

## REVIEW CRITERIA AT A GLANCE – OTHER

|   | Shared Instrumentation (S10)   | Construction and Modernization Grants (C06, UC6, G20)  | Administrative Centers (P30,P40,P41,P2C,R24,R28,U24,U41,U42,U2C)   |
|---|--|--|--|
| <b>Overall Impact</b>   | <u>Overall Impact/Benefit</u>  | <u>Overall Impact</u>  | <u>Overall Impact</u>  |
| <b>Scored Review Criteria</b><br>(Scored individually and considered in overall impact score)<br><br>PAR & RFA: May add questions to each scored criterion or additional criteria       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Justification of Need</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Technical Expertise</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Research Projects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Administration</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Institutional Commitment</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Scientific Merit and Organization of the Total Program and Its Component Parts to be Carried out in the Facility</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Administrative and Leadership Capabilities of the Applicant's Officers and Staff</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Anticipated Effect of the Project on Other Relevant Research Programs and Facilities in the Geographic Area and Nationwide</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Need for the Project/Additional Space</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Project Design</u></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Significance</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Investigator(s)</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Innovation</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Approach</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Environment</u></li> </ul>  |
| <b>Additional Review Criteria</b><br>(Not scored individually, but considered in overall impact score)<br><br>PAR & RFA: May add new criteria or questions to each additional criterion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Protections for Human Subjects</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Inclusion of Women, Minorities, &amp; Children</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Vertebrate Animals</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Biohazards</u></li> <li>• <u>Resubmission</u></li> <li>• <u>Renewal</u></li> <li>• <u>Revision</u></li> </ul> |
| <b>Additional Review Considerations</b><br>(Not scored individually and not considered in overall score)  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <u>Applications from Foreign Organizations</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Applications from Foreign Organizations</u></li> <li>• <u>Select Agents</u></li> <li>• <u>Resource Sharing Plans</u></li> <li>• <u>Authentication of Key Biological and/or Chemical Resources</u></li> <li>✓ <u>Budget &amp; Period of Support</u></li> </ul>        |
| <b>Additional Comments to Applicant</b>   | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  | <u>Additional Comments to Applicant</u>  |